



# Academy for Peace and Development Akaademiga Nabadda iyo Horumarka

## Report on the First Working Group Meeting Land Based Conflict Project



**Venue:** Venezia Restaurant, Hargeisa, Somaliland  
**Date:** 02.09.2007  
**Discussion Leader:** Mohamed Abdi (Lead Researcher)  
**Keeper of Minutes:** Safiya Tani and Nasir Osman (Trainees)



## Introduction

The meeting officially started at 9:00am with Quranic verses by Mr. Ahmed Ibrahim Awale. Then the Programme Coordinator of the Academy for Peace and Development (APD), Mr. Boobe, spoke opening words and introduced the participants (*Annex A: Participants*) to the research team, to the agenda of the workshop (*Annex B: Agenda of the working Group Meeting*) and to the role of APD. He also thanked the participants for their coming and said that APD highly appreciated that they gave their time.

After that, Mr. Mohamed Abdi, the Lead Researcher of the project and leader of the discussion, briefly explained the aims of the project. He said that the project is mainly focusing on land based conflict in rural areas. He added that the time frame of the project is only six months and that therefore it is not possible to cover both rural and urban land conflicts. Mr. Mohamed Abdi also told that the overall objective of the research project is to enhance local conflict resolution mechanism in the course of integrated capacity building, dialogue, and action research process, promoting awareness, analysis and good practices relating to natural resource based (land) conflicts.

Mr. Ulf Terlinden, the German Capacity Builder of the project from the Institute for Peace and Development (INEF) at the University of Duisburg-Essen, also thanked the participants for their coming and collaboration. After that, he explained shortly the principles of Participatory Action Research (PAR), the methodology used by the Academy for Peace and Development in their research, and described the role of the Working Group within this process (*Annex C: Role of the working group in Participatory Action Research – “PAR”*). The Members of the Working Group are expected to show commitment to an issue with national relevance, to be neutral and vocal. The participation in this workshop is voluntary. Then, he gave an introduction about what the team has so far covered and what will be done in the coming months.

Mr. Mohamed Abdi started the discussion by presenting a short summary of structure and contents of the Working Note. He said that the team has been working on this issue for a time of two months. But because there have not yet been any studies in these areas, it was hard to find related documents to land-based conflicts. After the desk study, literature review and some interviews with state officials, NGO and Civil Societies representatives, the team identified some key issues and problems that it considers to be key issues for conflicts on land (*Annex C: Structure of the Issue in the Working Note*).

Mr. Mohamed Abdi then opened the discussion, which was divided into one part on the working note, and one part on guidance and advice for the further research process.

## **Part 1: Discussion of the Working Note**

The participants were asked to discuss the following questions, comment on the working note which had been circulated prior to the meeting:

1. What are the issues in the different sections?
2. What do we miss out?
3. Are the issues in the working note relevant?
4. Why are these issues important?
5. Which issues should have priority?
6. What examples and evidence can you provide?

### **Key Comments from the Discussion:**

#### **1. What are the issues in the different sections?**

- To realize how people in pastoral areas want to manage their way of living, public participation is always needed.
- To find a law that secures pastoral land and grazing land, the Ministry of Pastoral Development and Environment should always consult with district committee or elders, because people know what is good for their livelihood.
- A review of historical interventions is important because today the role of the government is very weak and so it is good for NGOs to support, because the land law we have is not clear and we can say it is wrong, something is still missing.
- Page 11, paragraph two from the bottom: Pastoral societies do not come to the ministries and do not consult with them.

#### **2. What do we miss out?**

- On page 6, the section on pastoral land needs review because the referred document is not complete and was a draft document.
- On page 5, section 2.2.1 (State/ formal law): Management and mandate are two different issues so they must be clarified.
- The implementation of the law is also missing
- Conflicts mainly relate to water points, and this is not clear in the working note.
- The issue of population increase and livestock impacts on the issues which contribute to the problem must be included in the working note.
- Definitions of the Somali words are needed e.g. Xeer, Degaan etc.

#### **3. Are the issues in the working note relevant?**

- On page 5 - ban on Somali livestock: That statement is not relevant to the issue. It should be rephrased, because the issue of ban on Somali livestock by the Saudi government does not relate to Land-based conflicts. It is an assumption.

#### **4. Why are these issues important?**

- Poor governance is part of the problem which accelerates these issues.
- Privatization of state owned land and public greed to land is one of the issues that escalate into violent conflicts on land.
- Major conflicts arise because of the absence of the management law. The earlier government used to manage land but after the civil wars people manage land in their own way which creates the problem.
- Mismanagement of the natural resources is part of the issue.
- It is needed to categorize (and separate) the psychological issues and social issues that arise and relate to land conflicts.
- We have to know why enclosures are coming back again and again and how they can be removed.

#### **5. Which issues should have a priority?**

- Conflicts that arise from natural resources such as water points and grazing land.
- Land management and its potentiality.
- Economic transition of nomadic people, e.g. the effect of remittances and Qat on their economic status.
- Awareness raising through the use of religious leaders.
- Land development strategy must be given consideration.
- Laws should be laid down if they do not exist to manage land, and if they exist they should be enforced and put into action.
- Customary laws should be used into a modernized way and should be enforced.

#### **6. What examples and evidences can you provide?**

- At this time, coastal areas are better of environmentally than Hawd areas; this is because of the climate. In the hot coastal areas people do not stay long and as a result, the pastures are not overused. But in the Hawd it is cooler and people stay as long as possible, causing environmental degradation.
- It is clear that environment (land) has been degraded, because there is too little grazing land in both Hargeisa and Togdheer regions, and this is also why livestock was moved out of their traditional grazing territory.
- Land grabbing is because of insecurity, people feel that if they don't secure their own private land now, they will soon lose any access to land.
- Hariirad issue: ADO organization has solved the problem through the intervention of elders. Elders can mediate between the clans by telling them that land is sufficient if they share it equally. People rather solve the issue through traditional elders than through the official government law.
- Land conflicts in rural areas are more on enclosures because every one needs a land for his own. For instance, in 2004 in Tog-wajaale area, NERAD organization removed enclosures but after 2 years people again made enclosures. The reason is the problem of insecurity of land ownership.

## **Part 2: Guidance and Advice on the Research Process**

The participants were asked to discuss the following questions, advising the project team on the research process:

1. Which of the issues need (field) research?
2. Where could this research be undertaken?
3. What could be the case studies?
4. Can you recommend people to interview?
5. What activities to address the issues should be studied?

### **Key Comments from the Discussion:**

#### **1. Which of the issues need (field) research?**

- Conflict and resource management
- Resource/ethnic; group/settlements/population density should be considered to study areas where conflict could arise
- Other resources apart from grazing land and water sources, can also cause conflict.
- Outside interventions to nomads and their impacts – which are the dynamics?
- Community priorities on land use
- National priorities on land use and its distribution
- Enclosures
- Land development
- Directing people to other sources of income generation instead of land grabbing (e.g. fishery)

#### **2. Where could this research be undertaken?**

- Toon
  - Tog-wajaale
  - Allay-baday
  - West Balli-gubadle [because of grazing, water sources and enclosures]
  - Togdheer:
    - Warcimraan
    - Oodwayne
    - Balihiile
  - Demonstration sites: Different ecological Zones
    - mountainous areas
    - Coastal areas
  - Awdal Regions: Farms
  - Water
- 
- Comparison between sites; and also causes, management and for future solutions

### **3. What could be the case studies?**

- Preliminary studies should be first done
- Enclosures and conflicts
- Traditional context – e.g. ‘Degaan’
- Privatization of state owned land
- Institutional resource management
- Traditional system of conflict management
- Specific areas – that is, areas that conflict most arise
- Stay with them
- Farm boundaries

### **4. Can you recommend people to interview?**

- Traditional elders in rural areas with experience in land conflict resolutions
- Professionals
- Affected communities
- Different individuals of level from different regions and communities with different views
- External experiences

### **5. What activities to address the issue should be studied?**

- Field study – Historical timeline
- Hariirad
- Balli-gubadle
- Haqsoor
- Means they use – mechanism they use as resolutions

The discussion was closed at 12.30 by Mr. Mohamed Abdi and all participants were invited for lunch at Venezia Hotel.

**Annex A: List of Working Group Participants**  
**Venezia Hotel, Hargeisa, 02.09.2007**

<b>Number</b>	<b>Name</b>	<b>Organization</b>
1	Mohamed Muse Awale	NERAD
2	Ahmed Ibrahim Awale	Candlelight
3	Hassan Hussein Nuur	ADO
4	Mohamed Abdi Gargare	Ministry of Pastoral Development & Environment
5	Zeinab Ibrahim	Nagaad
6	Mohmed Hassan	APD
7	Abdirahman Abdisalan	Ministry of Water and Mineral Resources
8	Haroon Yusuf	Action Aid
9	Abdirahman Aided	Oxfam GB
10	Mohmed Ali Bidar	APD
11	Mohmed Abdi Omar	APD
12	Ulf Terlinden	APD/INEF
13	Jan Stockbrugger	APD
14	Safia Osman Tani	APD
15	Nassir Osman	APD
16	Ahmed Said Mohamed	APD
17	Arafat Samir	APD
18	Suad Cabdi	APD

## **Annex B: Agenda of the Working Group Meeting:**

**Meeting of the Working Group on Land-based Conflicts**

**SUNDAY, 02/09/07**

**At Venezia Restaurant**

### **AGENDA:**

TIME	TOPIC
8:00	Quran verses
8:05	Welcome by APD Management
8:15	Introduction of participants
8:25	Introduction of the project
8:40	Concept and role of working group
9:00	Short Presentation of the working note
9:10	Discussion <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• What are the issues in the different sections?</li><li>• What do we miss out?</li><li>• Are the issues in the working note relevant?</li><li>• Why are these issues important?</li><li>• Which issues should have priority?</li><li>• What examples and evidence can you provide?</li></ul>
10:00	BREAK
10:30	Continuation of the discussion
11:00	Guidance and advice on the research process: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Which of the issues need (field) research?</li><li>• Where could this research be undertaken?</li><li>• What would be the case studies?</li><li>• Can you recommend people to interview?</li><li>• What activities to address the issues should be studied?</li></ul>
12:15-1:45	NOON PRAYERS, LUNCH BREAK and closing

## **Annex C: Handout on the Role of the Working Groups in Participatory Action Research (PAR)**

### **Participatory Action Research**

- Used by social science researchers concerned with social problems, and focused on participative group processes for addressing conflict, crises and change.
- Identification of problems/issues and challenges facing the community.
- Looking for actions/interventions to solve those problems.
- Identification of local initiatives in reconciliation, political, economic & social reconstruction.

### **Usefulness of PAR**

- Creates dialogue between different stakeholders working on the issue/problem
- Reflects on the view points of communities of people living at all levels, regardless of their differences age, sex , political/religious view
- Promotes better understanding of the national issue and their underlying causes
- People “learn best”, and more willingly apply what they have learned.

### **The Participatory Process**

- Preliminary Content phase (Research Team)
- Process phase (guided by Working Group)
- Product phase (Research Team)
- Dissemination phase (Working Group and Researchers)

### **Working Group and its Role**

- Owners of the research (Give legitimacy to the action research)
- Guide and assist the researchers during the process of the action research
- Identification of key issues/problems and challenges
- Focusing issues
- Identification of key stakeholders in the research
- Developing plan of action

*Further roles, normally undertaken by National Project Group:*

- Validate the product of the action research
- Hand-over the product to the stakeholders for endorsement
- Following up the actions
- Identification of further action research or in-depth analysis
- Disseminations of the product

### **Characteristics of the Working Group (Guiding principles)**

- |                                    |              |               |
|------------------------------------|--------------|---------------|
| • Commitment to a (national) issue | • Neutrality | • Influential |
|                                    | • Vocal      | • Voluntary   |

### **The Role of the Research Team**

- Lead and guide the process
- Facilitate dialogue
- Listen & observe
- Nurture local leaders to the point where they can take responsibility of the process
- Report & document

## **Annex D: Structure of the Issues in the Working Note**

### 3. Issues and problems

- 3.1 Origins and Dynamics of conflict
  - 3.1.1 Inequitable access to shrinking common pool resources
    - Proliferation of water resources
    - Changing movement patterns and sedentarization
    - Deforestation as a result of charcoal production
    - Land enclosures and the breakdown of common user rights
  - 3.1.2 Legacy of War
    - Displacement of people in times of conflict
    - Privatisation of Formerly state-owned agricultural land
  - 3.1.3 Public greed on land
    - Unclear land ownership and illegal documentation
    - Degaan and the politicisation of land conflicts
- 3.2 Resource management
  - Lack of proper land planning
  - Poor governance
  - Legal pluralism
- 3.3 Conflict management
  - 3.3.1 Poor arbitration
    - Shortcomings of the formal system
    - Shortcoming of the Traditional system
    - Institutional overlap
  - 3.3.2 Weak Enforcement

### **Earlier Publications related to Land Conflicts:**

*From Plunder and Profit to Prosperity and Peace.*

Resolving Resource-based Conflict in Somaliland.

Academy for Peace and Development (APD) and Interpeace, Hargeisa, November 2006.

English, 38 pages.

*Regulating the Livestock Economy of Somaliland*

*In: Rebuilding Somaliland: Issues and Possibilities.*

Academy for Peace and Development (APD) and War-torn Societies Project (WSP),

Lawrenceville, N.J.: Red Sea Press, 2005. ISBN: 1569022291. English, 402 pages.

### **Earlier Documentary Films related to Land Conflicts:**

*From Plunder and Profit to Prosperity and Peace*

(Boob iyo Bursi ku doorso Nabad iyo Badhaadhe) (2006)

Documentary on Resource-based Conflict in Somaliland.

31 min., Somali and English version.

*Natural Resource-based Conflicts*

(Khilaafaadka khayraadka Dabiiciga ah) (2005)

Documentary on charcoal production and environmental destruction.

16 min., Somali with English sub-titles.

*Milking Our Camels Dry*

(Intaanu Neefku kugu ciyin) (2002)

Documentary on Somaliland's livestock economy and trade, the pastoral environment and animal health services.

25 min., Somali and English versions.

### **Imprint**

This report is published by the Academy for Peace and Development, Hargeisa/Somaliland, in partnership with the Institute for Development and Peace (INEF), University Duisburg-Essen, Germany. For further information on the Land Conflicts Project, please visit: <http://www.apd-somaliland.org/projects.htm#land>



**Academy for Peace and Development**  
**Akaademiga Nabadda iyo Horumarka**

Hargeisa, Somaliland:

Phone: (+252-2-) 520304

Thuraya: +8821643338171/

+8821643341206

email@ apd-somaliland.org

Burco, Somaliland:

(+252-2-) 712980/81/82

+8821643341202/

+8821643341204

burco@ apd-somaliland.org

<http://www.apd-somaliland.org>

*in partnership with:*



Geibelstrasse 41,

D-47057 Duisburg

Germany

(+49-203-) 3794420

<http://www.inef.de>

*This project receives generous support by the German Federal Foreign Office and the Institute for Foreign Relations:*



Auswärtiges Amt

if a

Institut für  
Auslandsbeziehungen